



International Journal of Doctoral Studies

*An Official Publication
of the Informing Science Institute
InformingScience.org*

IJDS.org

Volume 17, 2022

Senior Editor-in-Chief: Michael Jones, University of Wollongong, (Australia)

Editor-in-Chief: Nicole A. Buzzetto-Hollywood, University of Maryland Eastern Shore (USA)

Associate Editors-in-Chief:

Chipo Mutongi, City of Harare, Zimbabwe Open University (Zimbabwe)

Wing Shui (Walter) Ng, The Education University of Hong Kong (Hong Kong)

Peter John Sandiford, The University of Adelaide (Australia)

Simona Scarparo, Deakin University, (Australia)

Managing Editor: Eli Cohen, Informing Science Institute (USA)

Publisher: Elizabeth Boyd, Informing Science Institute (USA)

Editors:

Ahabab Ahamed Chowdhury, University of Wollongong (Australia)

Allyson Kelley, University of North Carolina at Greensboro (USA)

Associate Editors:

Mohammed Isam Mohammed Abdel-Magid,
AlHawraa Hospital of Ummlujj (Oman)

Ana Paula Alves, Universidade Fernando Pessoa
(Portugal)

Jay R Avella, Grand Canyon University (USA)

Adriana Burlea-Schiopoiu, University of Craiova
(Romania)

Devasmita Chakraverty, Indian Institute of
Management (India)

Emin Taner Elmas, IGDİR University (Turkey)

John Anthony Fulton, University of Sunderland
(United Kingdom)

June Maul, Grand Canyon University (USA)

Kadie J Hayward Mullins, Embry-Riddle
Aeronautical University (USA)

Charles Randy Nichols, Kentucky State
University (USA)

Felix O Quayson, Nassau University Medical
Center (USA)

Cynthia P. Ruppel, Nova Southeastern University
(USA)

Pamela Felder Small, Independent Scholar (USA)

Nick J Sciuillo, Georgia State University (USA)

Tajullah X. Sky Lark, Sustainable Knowledge
Global Solutions (USA)

Sonya C. Thomas, Cornerstone University (USA)

Norma J. Turner, Grand Canyon University
(USA)

Jenna M Weglarz-Ward, University of Nevada
Las Vegas (USA)

The mission of the *International Journal of Doctoral Studies* (IJDS) is to provide readers worldwide with high quality peer-reviewed scholarly articles on a wide variety of issues in doctoral studies using the Informing Science (IS) framework. The editorial objective of IJDS is to inform all those involved with doctoral education regardless of specific discipline. IJDS articles discuss issues such as (but not limited to) the following: doctoral supervision, doctoral dissertation and/or research, the nature and future of doctoral programs, doctoral program design, experiences in doctoral programs, attrition and persistence in doctoral programs, doctoral qualifiers and examinations, doctoral program accreditation, copyright and intellectual properties in doctoral research, climate and support for doctoral study, career path and employment of doctoral graduates, methodology, methods and theory development, as well as research and publication issues in academia. Read more about the scope of papers accepted by IJDS here: <http://www.informingscience.org/Journals/IJDS/Information>

IJDS especially encourages publications authored by faculty members and/or academic administrators who actively supervise doctoral students, teach doctoral courses, and/or oversee doctoral programs. Joint publications between faculty members and their doctoral students are also encouraged.

While IJDS is principally an interdisciplinary forum that publishes high quality articles on theory, practice, innovation, and research covering any aspect of doctoral studies, book reviews are also welcome. Authors may use bodies of knowledge from diverse fields of research. However, IJDS is not a general outlet for doctoral students who wish to publish their doctoral research, unless their doctoral research is related to investigation of the issues indicated above. IJDS provides those who submit manuscripts for publication with useful, timely feedback by making the review process constructive. IJDS is the world premier scholarly peer-reviewed journal on doctoral studies. All submissions are blind refereed by three or more peers. IJDS articles appear online free of charge on the web site <http://ijds.org>

IJDS is listed in:

Australian Government Excellence in Research for Australia Initiative Ranking "B".
Cabell's Directory of Publishing Opportunities in Educational Technology & Library Science,
Cabell's Directory of Publishing Opportunities in Educational Curriculum and Methods,
Cabell's Directory of Publishing Opportunities in Educational Psychology and Administration,
EBSCO Publishing's Index of Academic Journals (Education Research Complete -- Full Text),
Scopus
Ulrichs

(CC BY-NC 4.0) The articles in this journal are licensed under a [Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/). When you copy and redistribute this paper in full or in part, you need to provide proper attribution to it to ensure that others can later locate this work (and to ensure that others do not accuse you of plagiarism). You may (and we encourage you to) adapt, remix, transform, and build upon the material for any non-commercial purposes. This license does not permit you to use this material for commercial purposes.

ISSN Print 1556-8881, Online 1556-8873

Published by the Informing Science Institute
131 Brookhill Ct., Santa Rosa, California USA
phone: +1-707-531-4925;
<http://informingscience.org>

IJDS Volume 17, 2022 – Table of Contents

Pastoral Care in Doctoral Education: A Collaborative Autoethnography of Belonging and Academic Identity Danielle Hradsky, Ali Soyooof, Shaoru Zeng, Elham M. Foomani, Ngo Cong-Lem, Jacky-Lou Maestre, Lynette Pretorius	1-23
Fostering the Success of Working-Class Latina Doctoral Students at Predominantly White Institutions Loni Crumb	25-38
Progress-Oriented Workshops for Doctoral Well-being: Evidence From a Two-Country Design-Based Research Luis P. Prieto, Paula Odriozola-González, María Jesús Rodríguez-Triana, Yannis Dimitriadis, Tobias Ley	39-66
The Evolution of Personal Frames of Reference: Metaphors as Potential Space Aden-Paul Flotman, Antoni Barnard	67-86
Chinese International Doctoral Students’ Cross-Cultural Socialization: Leveraging Strengths and Multiple Identities Shihua Chen Brazill	87-114
The (National) Doctoral Dissertations Assessment in China: An Interpretive Phenomenological Analysis Ahmed Alduais, Abdulghani Muthanna, Fabian William Nyenyembe, Jim Chatambalala, Markos Tezera Taye, Md Shahabul Haque, Mjege Kinyota, Patrick Severine Kavenuke	115-140
A Thematic Analysis of the Structure of Delimitations in the Dissertation David C. Coker	141-159
Doctoral Writers’ Resiliency in the COVID-19 Pandemic Alice Shu-Ju Lee, William J Donohue, Shelah Simpson, Kathleen Vacek	161-180
Research Supervision of International Doctoral Students: Perspectives of International Students in Two Comprehensive Universities in China Marinette Bahtilla	181-199
Education Doctoral Students’ Self-Study of Their Identity Development: A Thematic Review Xing-Ya Xu, Margret A. Hjalmarson	201-225
Iranian Ph.D. Candidates’ Perceptions Toward Their Supervisors’ Responsibilities and Activities Farzad Rostami, Mohammad Hossein Yousefi	224-241
The Open Cage: A Force for Transformative Learning in Professional Doctoral Studies During COVID-19 John Fulton, Lynne Hall, Derek Watson, Gillian Hagan-Green	243-261
‘Smile and Nod’ or More? Reassessing the Role of the Silent Supervisor in the Doctoral Viva Vijay Kumar, Amrita Kaur, Sharon Sharmini, Mohammad Noman	263-277
Academic Identity Development of Doctoral Scholars in an Online Writing Group Khim Raj Subedi, Shyam Sharma, Krishna Bista	279-300

Meaningful or Meaningless? Organizational Conditions Influencing Doctoral Students' Mental Health and Achievement Francesco Tommasi, Ferdinando Toscano, Davide Giusino, Andrea Ceschi, Riccardo Sartori, Johanna Lisa Degen	301-321
Academic Identity Development of Asian International Doctoral Students at a Public University – A Reflexive Thematic Analysis Trang Pham	323-344
A Multilayered Approach to Understand and Imagine Doctoral Students' Spaces of Learning Serveh Naghshbandi	345-384
Using Analytical Thought Process to Develop Instructional Rubrics in Writing Doctoral Dissertation Research Problem Statement – A Follow-Up Study Azad Ali, Shardul Pandya, Umesh Varma	385-399
The Effort-Reward-Imbalance Among PhD Students – A Qualitative Study Melanie Vilser, Sabrina Rauh, Irmgard Mausz, Dieter Frey	401-432
Writing Doctoral Dissertation Literature Review: Identifying the Prerequisites, Corequisites, and the Iterative Process for Writing the Literature Azad Ali, Shardul Pandya, Umesh Varma	433-458
Experiences of University Professors Studying for a Doctoral Degree in the Mexican Context Sara Elvira Galbán-Lozano, Ligia Garcia-Bejar	459-477
Information Literacy, Research Self-Efficacy, and Research Productivity of Doctoral Students in Universities in Ogun State, Nigeria Paul Adesola Adekunle, Ezinwanyi Madukoma	479-511
Predicting Algerian Doctoral Students' Academic Burnout Using the Expectancy-Value Model: The Effect of Faculty Attachment and Years of Enrolment Rida Sellali, Nour El Houda Lahiouel	513-532
Self-Care Amongst Doctoral Students: A Pilot Study of Domestic and International Students in a Texas Public University Emily Holtz, Xin Li, Ying Xu, Salandra Grice	533-552